Arrow's Impossibility Theorem

If the number of alternatives is at least three, there is no social preference function that satisfies the five axioms.

Borda count

===

- n alternatives, m voters
- \bullet each voter submits a strict ranking of the alternatives
- for each voter the top alternative receives n points, the second (n-1) points, etc.
- for each alternative we take the sum of each individual score
- alternatives are ranked according to the computed score

| | Voter 1 | Voter 2 | Voter 3 | score |
|-------|---------|---------|---------|-------|
| best | a | b | С | |
| | b | a | b | |
| worst | c | С | a | |

Which of Arrow's axioms does the Borda count satisfy?

1. Unrestricted domain?

2. Rationality?

- 3. Unanimity?
- 4. Non-dictatorship?

5. Independence of irrelevant alternatives?

| Voter: | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 |
|--------|---|---|---|---|---|-----|---|
| best | x | a | b | x | a | b | x |
| | c | x | a | c | x | a | c |
| | b | c | x | b | c | x | b |
| worst | a | b | С | a | b | c | a |

Social ranking:

| Voter: | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 |
|--------|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| best | С | a | b | С | a | b | c |
| | b | c | a | b | c | a | b |
| | a | b | c | a | b | c | a |
| worst | x | x | x | x | x | x | x |

Kemeny-Young method

For each pair of alternatives, x and y, count:

- (1) the number of individuals for whom $x \succ y$; denote it by $\#(x \succ y)$,
- (2) the number of individuals for whom $x \sim y$; denote it by $\#(x \sim y)$, (3) the number of individuals from whom $y \succ x$ denote it by $\#(y \succ x)$.

Next go through all the complete and transitive rankings of X and for each compute a total score by adding up the scores of each pairwise ranking.

Example: $X = \{A, B, C\}, S = \{1, 2, 3, 4, 5\}$

| | voter 1 | voter 2 | voter 3 | voter 4 | voter 5 |
|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| best | A | В | В | C | В |
| | B | C | C | A | A |
| worst | C | A | A | В | C |

| Ranking | Score |
|---------------------|-------|
| $A \succ B \succ C$ | |
| $A \succ C \succ B$ | |
| $B \succ A \succ C$ | |
| $B \succ C \succ A$ | |
| $C \succ A \succ B$ | |
| $C \succ B \succ A$ | |

Which of Arrow's axioms does Kemeny-Young satisfy?

1. Unrestricted domain?

2. Rationality?

3. Unanimity? requires some proof: see textbook

4. Non-dictatorship?

5. Independence of irrelevant alternatives?

| | | 1 | | 3 | | | | 7 | |
|----|---------------|---|---|---|----|-----|----------|---|--|
| | best | A | A | A | В | В | C | C | |
| | | B | B | В | C | C | A | A | |
| | best worst | C | C | C | A | A | $A \\ B$ | B | |
| ոտ | | | | | Sc | ore | | | |

| Ranking | Score |
|---------------------|-------|
| $A \succ B \succ C$ | |
| $A \succ C \succ B$ | |
| $B \succ A \succ C$ | |
| $B \succ C \succ A$ | |
| $C \succ A \succ B$ | |
| $C \succ B \succ A$ | |
| | |

Social ranking:

| | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 |
|-------|---|---|---|--------------|---|---|---|
| best | A | A | A | \mathbf{C} | С | C | C |
| | B | B | B | В | В | A | A |
| worst | C | C | C | Α | Α | B | B |

| Ranking | Score |
|---------------------|-------|
| $A \succ B \succ C$ | |
| $A \succ C \succ B$ | |
| $B \succ A \succ C$ | |
| $B \succ C \succ A$ | |
| $C \succ A \succ B$ | |
| $C \succ B \succ A$ | |